



November 16, 2018

**VIA ECF**

The Honorable Lois H. Goodman, U.S.M.J.  
U.S. District Court for the District of New Jersey  
Clarkson S. Fisher Building and U.S. Courthouse  
402 East State Street  
Trenton, New Jersey 08608

**Re: *In re Valeant Pharmaceuticals International, Inc. Securities Litigation*  
Master File No. 15-7658 (MAS) (LHG)**

Richard Hernandez  
Partner  
T. 973-848-8615  
F. 973-297-6615  
rhernandez@mccarter.com

Dear Judge Goodman:

On behalf of Defendant Valeant Pharmaceuticals International, Inc. ("Valeant"), I write with respect to Plaintiffs' Memoranda of Law in support of their motion to compel non-parties Philidor Rx Services, LLC ("Philidor") and other entities to produce documents (ECF Nos. 386-1, 394-1), and Philidor's Response in Opposition (ECF No. 391). While Valeant takes no position with respect to Plaintiffs' motion to compel, we must correct certain factual representations.

The premise of Plaintiffs' and Philidor's arguments is that Valeant controls Philidor and may access its documents. See Plaintiffs' Br. at 17 (asserting that Valeant "has had full access to Philidor's documents nearly the entire time the case has been pending"); Philidor's Opp. at 14 ("Plaintiffs assert in their Motion to Compel that Valeant controls Philidor and Valeant has access to the documents Plaintiffs seek from Philidor in their subpoenas. Valeant may dispute those allegations, but if they are true, Plaintiffs can simply issue a discovery request under Fed. R. Civ. P. 34 to Valeant."); Plaintiffs' Reply at 6 (asserting that "Valeant has access to and is maintaining" Philidor's documents). Although it received approximately 800 documents in late 2015 and early 2016, Valeant does not control or otherwise have access to Philidor's documents.

Respectfully submitted,

s/ Richard Hernandez

Richard Hernandez

cc: All Counsel of Record (via ECF)

McCarter & English, LLP  
Four Gateway Center  
100 Mulberry Street  
Newark, NJ 07102-4056  
T. 973.622.4444  
F. 973.624.7070  
www.mccarter.com

BOSTON

HARTFORD

STAMFORD

NEW YORK

NEWARK

EAST BRUNSWICK

PHILADELPHIA

WILMINGTON

WASHINGTON, DC